

GERMAN VILLAGE COMMISSION AGENDA

Tuesday, April 3, 2018 4:00 p.m. German Village Meeting Haus – 588 S. Third Street

Note: The Historic Preservation Office is scheduled to move to 111 N. Front Street on April 9'2018. Following the move, all Business Meeting and Hearings will be located at that address. Hearing room(s) to be determined.

<u>Applicants or their representatives must attend this hearing</u>. If applicants are absent, it is likely that the application will be continued until the Commission's next hearing. If you have any questions, please call the city's Historic Preservation Office staff at 614-645-0664.

If you need assistance in participating in this meeting due to a disability under the ADA, please call the City's ADA Coordinator at (614) 645-7206 at least three (3) business days prior to the scheduled meeting or event to request an accommodation.

- I. CALL TO ORDER
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING 12:00 PM (NOON), Tuesday, April 24, 2018 -111 N. Front Street (Michael B. Coleman Government Center); Room To Be Determined.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING 4:00 p.m., Tuesday, May 1, 2018
 111 N. Front Street (Michael B. Coleman Government Center); Room To Be Determined.
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES, Tuesday, March 6, 2018
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. PUBLIC FORUM
- German Village Commission By-Laws Revisions
 - Revisions required to Article VI (1) and (2) in regard to business meeting and hearing locations and public notice.
 - Additional revisions will be brought before the Commission at the May1, 2018 GVC hearing. These revisions will conform bylaws with Columbus City Code 3119.07.
- Note of Appreciation to the German Village Society



IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. 18-4-24 (*not required to attend*)

637 Brust Street

Bryan Gramlich (Applicant)

Bryan & Lauren Gramlich (Owner)

An application, photographs, and product cut sheet have been submitted. Staff has conducted a site visit. Remove and Repair/Replace Siding

- Complete selective, exploratory removal of existing, deteriorated, non-original, cedar shake siding, per the submitted photographs, to determine condition of original, V-Groove, wood siding beneath.
- Upon determination that the existing wood siding is in good condition and repairable, remove all non-original, wood shake siding.
- Repair and/or replace existing V-Groove, wood siding, as needed.
- Repair/replace any deteriorated wood trim, as needed. All replacement wood to match existing profile.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Final paint color to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

2. 18-4-25 (*not required to attend*)

1147 Jaeger Street

Megan Zahnow (Applicant)

Lisa Pasko & David Cattee (Owners)

An application, photographs, and renderings have been submitted.

Install Window Graphics

- Remove the existing window graphics in the two (2) storefront windows, per the submitted photograph.
- Install new, "White," cut vinyl lettering and logos on the exterior of the two (2) storefront windows, per the submitted renderings.
- Logo for Left Window: Height = 17.85", Width = 48" (approx. 6 sf.).
- Logo for Right Window: Height = 21.69", Width = 39.5" (approx. 6 sf.).

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 4:10 P.M.

3, 18-4-26

622 Mohawk Street

Tim Meager (Applicant/Owner)

An application and photographs have been submitted.

Chimney Repair / West Chimney

- Remove existing, deteriorated parging on the west-facing chimney, and apply fresh mortar to repair any cracks or
- If extensive deterioration of brick is discovered, the chimney may be rebuilt by removing all defective material. Replace any/all damaged and missing brick with brick that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- New mortar must be no harder than the historic mortar to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm).
- Remove the existing stone cap and install a new, limestone cap to match the existing in size and profile.

German Village Commission April 3, 2018 Agenda Page 3 of 19

Modify Chimney / East Chimney

- Remove approximately five feet (5') from the top of the chimney, to bring it to the height of the west-facing chimney.
- Remove all non-original, and inappropriate mortar from the brick chimney with the appropriate hand tools to a depth of no less than one inch (1").
- Moisten surface with water and solid point with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm).
- Remove the existing stone cap and install a new, limestone cap to match the existing in size and profile.

HOLDOVERS

4. 18-1-12 (*not required to attend*)

688 Mohawk Street

Donald Thibaut (Applicant/Owner)

An existing, rear elevation greenhouse structure was enlarged prior to review and approval. A code order has been issued. The greenhouse will be removed by mid-May. A detailed application will be submitted prior to reconstruction in the Fall. No Action Required at this time.

Retain Temporary Greenhouse Structure

- Retain the existing, rear elevation greenhouses structure, per the submitted site plan and photographs, as installed prior to review and approval.
- Structure replaces two (2) structures measuring 16' x 7' and 16' x 9'.
- Structure consists of cedar and plexiglass, and is bolted together for easy dismantling. It is bolted to the rear wall of the house.
- Structure to be installed in late fall and removed in spring each year to protect existing palm and citrus trees.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 4:20 P.M.

5. 18-3-11

711 Mohawk Street

Steve Dempsey/Dave Fox Remodeling (Applicant)

Jerry & Jennifer Guy (Owners)

This application was reviewed and continued from the March 6, 2018 GVC hearing. Revised drawings have been submitted.

Construct Two-Story Addition

- Remove trellis and roof of existing one-story addition and add second story.
- Exterior siding to be 6" Cove Dutch lap wood siding
- All windows to be Pella Reserve Series windows with clad exterior.
- Roofing shingles to be Slateline "English Gray".
- Restore landscaping excluding the trellis component.
- No tree removal to take place.
- Install new A. C. unit to the side elevation screened by plantings or fencing.

The following is from the March 6, 2018 GVC hearing:

Commissioner Comments:

German Village Commission April 3, 2018 Agenda Page 4 of 19

- Even if the brick on an addition was a different color than the main structure, the material would not be subservient to the main structure. Would also have concerns with thin brick. Even though the GVC has approved it a few times, it has not been successful in the past.
- The change to a traditional gabled roof is a positive move. A zero overhang would not be supported by the Commission. It should be 8"-12" with a traditional gable roof.
- Consider adding some windows on the north elevation.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 4:30 P.M.

NEW APPLICATIONS

6. 18-4-27

210 Thurman Avenue

Jeff Excell & Lauren Culley/Fox in the Snow (Applicants)

Red Gate Partners, LLC (Owners)

An application, photographs, and a rendering have been submitted.

Install Heat-Applied Vinyl Logo

- Install one (1) removable, heat-applied, vinyl "fox" logo to the non-original, brick veneer façade, per the submitted rendering.
- New logo to be lit by existing, exterior lighting.

7. 18-4-28

595 South Sixth Street

Dave Plunkett (Applicant)

Jim Plunkett (Owner)

An application for a covered deck was conceptually reviewed November 8, 2-017 and an inset porch was denied January 3, 2018. A new application with a more open, revised design has been submitted.

New Inset Porch

- Build a new 93 sf, covered porch within the ell on west side of existing house, per the submitted site plan.
- Porch to be free standing, with pilasters adjacent to exterior brick wall (not attached to brick wall).
- Porch to be painted wood with 5 1/4" x 6" wood decking and painted wood posts, steps, and railings.
- Railing to be a single, horizontal, wood railing, to match existing railing on front porch.
- Top of porch deck to be below the water table.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 4:50 P.M.

8. 18-4-29

174 Nursery Lane

Urban Order Architecture (Applicant)

Simi Botic & Tim Simeone (Owners)

An application for a new addition was conceptually reviewed July 5, 2017. An application, photographs, and revised elevation drawings have been submitted.

New Addition

- Construct a new, frame addition to existing, frame, one-and-one-half story, single-family dwelling.
- Exterior cladding to be smooth, clear, cedar, to match existing.
- Exterior trim to be 5/4 smooth, clear, cedar, to match existing, including band board and cap at base of wall, to match existing.
- Roofing to be asphalt shingle, to match existing shingles on main roof.
- Windows to be aluminum-clad wood from the approved windows list.
- Full-light door on east elevation to be aluminum-clad wood.
- Foundation to be brick to match existing.

The following is from the July 5, 2017 GVC hearing:

German Village Commission April 3, 2018 Agenda Page 5 of 19

<u>Commissioner Panzer:</u>

- Concerns about the roof of the addition being higher than the existing house.
- Thinks it has the appearance of two houses that have been connected together rather than an addition.
- *The front porch on the addition gives it the appearance of two houses.*

Commissioner Hartke:

There needs to be a change in siding materials between the existing house and the addition. NO ACTION TAKEN

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 5:10 P.M.

9. 18-4-30 (Variance Recommendation)

804 City Park Avenue & 76 East Kossuth Avenue

William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)

Nelson Heinrichs III (Owner)

An application, photographs, site plan, and statement of hardship have been submitted.

Request for Variance Recommendation

A request for the following variances is requested in anticipation of combining the two (2) parcels into one singlefamily residence, with a one-story, rear addition to 804 City Park Avenue and a connector to 76 E. Kossuth Ave. Variance listing for 804 City Park Ave. / R-2F Single Family Use:

- 3332.18 (D) Building Lot Coverage: from 50.0% max to 3146 sf (53.7%)
- 2. Building Setbacks: from 10.0' to 1.75' along City Park Ave. and 1.0' along E. Kossuth St. 3332.21
- Maximum Side Yards: from 20% min to 2.58' (4.128%) 3. 3332.25
- 4. 3332.26 Minimum Side yards: from 5.0' min to 1.58' on north side and 1.0' on south side
- 5. 3332.27 Minimum Rear Yard: from 25% to 569 sf (9.7%)
- 3332.30 Vision Clearance: To allow the structure to extend 5.0' into the clear vision triangle 6.

10. 18-4-31

755 Macon Alley

William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)

755 Macon Alley LLC. (Owner)

An application, photographs, site plan, and statement of hardship have been submitted. Variance package for maneuvering, surface parking, and frontage, was recommended for approval on February 6, 2018.

Construct New Two-Car Garage

- Construct a new, frame, two-car garage, to provide parking for 755 Macon Alley and 754 Mohawk Street, per the submitted drawings.
- Roofing shingles to be from the approved roofing shingles list.
- Pedestrian doors on the north and south elevations to be four-panel, Therma-Tru, Smooth Star fiberglass, per the submitted product cut sheet.
- Four-lite, casement window on west elevation to be Lincoln, wood window, per the submitted product cut sheet.
- Wood trim to be per the submitted elevation drawings.
- Overhead doors on west and east elevations to be smooth, flush wood doors. Cut sheet to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 5:30 P.M.

11. 18-4-32 (Conceptual Review)

738-742 Jaeger Street

William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)

Jon O. Knitter (Owner)

An application and photographs have been submitted.

Modify Existing Garage or Build New Garage

- Conceptual discussion to modify the existing, circa 1924 concrete block garage by expanding the depth (interior currently 16' 6" Deep).
- Alter the three (3) existing overhead garage door openings to two (2) overhead garage door openings.
- Demolish the existing circa 1924 concrete block garage and construct a new, three-car garage.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 5:35 P.M.

12. 18-4-33

201 East Whittier Street

Ohio Exteriors, LLC. (Applicant)

Angela Legget (Owner)

An application, photographs, site plan, and elevation drawings have been submitted.

New Addition

- Construct a new, two-story, frame addition at the southeast corner of the house, per the submitted drawings.
- Roofing material to match existing asphalt shingles on main structure.
- Exterior cladding to be painted, clapboard siding with 6" exposure, to contrast with 4" exposure on main structure.
- Windows to be aluminum-clad wood, with flat, 1x4 casings.
- New door on north elevation to match existing six-panel wood door.
- New front porch to have concrete deck and steps and painted wood columns.

13. 18-4-34

201 East Whittier Street

Ohio Exteriors, LLC. (Applicant)

Angela Legget (Owner)

An application, photographs, site plan, and elevation drawings have been submitted.

Request for Variance Recommendation

1. 3332.25 Maximum Side Yards: from 20% min to 4.7' (15.16%)

CONCEPTUAL REVIEWS

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 5:50 P.M.

14. 18-4-35

121 East Frankfort Street

Wade Steen & Mary Steen (Applicant/Owner)

An application, photographs, and site plan have been submitted. Significant changes were made to the original concrete block garage and brick cottage in 1979 and 1989.

Build New Connector

- Remove existing walkway connecting the house to the garage and build a new connector.
- Demolish existing, circa 1930s, concrete block garage, and build new garage.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:00 P.M.

15, 18-4-36

247-281 E. Livingston Avenue

John Leonard/Berardi & Partners (Applicant)

Cedar Square, LLC. (Owner)

This application was conceptually reviewed at the February 6 and March 6, 2018 GVC hearing: An application, site plan, floor plans, elevation drawings, and photos have been submitted in response to previous comments.

Demolition

• Demolish the existing, ca. 1981, two-story, brick building at 247-257 E. Livingston Avenue, per the submitted photographs. To be replaced by "Building A."

New Construction / 247-257 E. Livingston Avenue (Bldg A)

- Build a new, three-story, 25 unit, residential building, with two-stories facing onto E. Livingston Avenue (north elevation), with a setback third story per the submitted drawings.
- Two story element to face onto E. Blenkner Street.
- Exterior cladding to include a combination of red and gray brick, and light-smooth face panel or cementitious siding.
- Windows to be wood, one-over-one, double hung sash with stone lintels and continuous stone sills.
- Some units facing onto E. Livingston Avenue to include window walls with steel guardrails.

New Construction / Vacant Lot / 277 E. Livingston (Bldg E)

- Build a new, four-story, 24 unit, residential building, with two-stories facing onto E. Livingston Avenue (north elevation) with a setback third story, per the submitted drawings.
- Exterior cladding to include a combination of red and gray brick, and light-smooth face panel or cementitious siding.
- Windows to be wood, one-over-one, double hung sash with stone lintels and continuous stone sills.
- Some units to include window walls with steel guardrails.
- Adjacent surface parking lot to include 48 spaces.

Renovation of Existing Structures

• There is a potential for an additional 12 units, with future renovation of existing structures

The following is from the March 6, 2018 GVC hearing:

Commissioner Ours:

- Understands the Applicants view that E. Livingston could be viewed as an "edge condition" in comparison with other streets in German Village.
- The proposed buildings are not subservient to the existing, surrounding buildings.
- The buildings on the south side of Blenkner Street will need to be treated with sensitivity. Provide renderings showing the existing Blenkner Street buildings.
- The comments of Zoning Department staff will need to be taken into consideration.
- Thinks the parking provided will need to be close to the requirement for the number of beds plus the restaurant.
- Seems a bit strange not to provide any commercial use on the first floor level.
- Appreciates that the height of the buildings has been lowered, but thinks they're still a story too high.
- Provide comparisons with other developments that have worked to meet parking needs.

Commissioner Panzer:

- *Is in agreement with the comments of Commissioner Ours.*
- Will need to look closely at traffic patterns and any circulation issues.

Commissioner Ferriell:

• Four stories at the rear of the development will dwarf the houses on Blenkner Street and diminish the adjacent houses on E. Livingston Avenue.

Commissioner Durst:

• Is in agreement with the comments of Commissioner Ours.

German Village Commission April 3, 2018 Agenda Page 8 of 19

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:15 P.M.

16, 18-4-37

759 South Sixth Street

Matt Mutchler/F5 Design (Applicant)

Jeff & Lynette Woda (Owner)

An application, site plan, photographs, and elevation drawings have been submitted.

Convert Porch to Living Space

- Convert the existing, enclosed porch to finished living space, per the submitted drawings (total 188 sf.).
- Flat roof to be converted to gable roof.
- Exterior cladding to be 2 ½" exposure lap siding with 1 x 4 corner boards.
- Siding color to be SW Iron Ore. Trim to be SW Tricorn Black. Doors/Windows to be SW Tricorn Black.
- Stone foundation to match existing on main structure.
- Add a 155 sf roof over the existing patio.

Demolish Existing Garage & Build New Garage

- Demolish the existing ca. 1970, two-car garage.
- Build a new 544 sf garage, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.

17. 18-4-38

100 Thurman Avenue

Brian P. Collins/Bcf Design & Development, Ltd. (Applicant)

Pamela & Paul Albrecht (Owner)

An application, site plan, photographs, and elevation drawings have been submitted.

Modify Garage

- Modify the existing, ca. 1986 garage by adding an additional parking bay, stair, and second story.
- Variances for increasing the height of the garage from the limit of 15ft to 22 ft and for allowing habitable space above a garage.
- Add one additional parking bay to the east of the existing garage, in place of the existing gravel parking area.
- Total square footage to increase from 440 sf to 720 sf.
- Second story space to be used as recreation/exercise space and home office space.
- Second floor space to include a bathroom.

STAFF APPROVALS

(The following applicants are not required to attend)

18-4-1

530 City Park Avenue

Michael Elder (Applicant)

Keith C. Mitchell (Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-1, 530 City Park Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be the following from the approved shingles list:

	<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
•	[] GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	[] English Gray Slate

German Village Commission April 3, 2018 Agenda Page 9 of 19

[] Weathered Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents.

• 18-4-2

618 South Third Street

Cliff Berman/Advantage Window & Door (Applicant)

Virginia Rothschild (Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-2, 618 South Third Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Rear Entrance Door

- Remove the existing, deteriorated, wooden, half-light, two-panel door on the rear elevation, per the submitted photographs.
- Install a new, custom built, wooden (ash), half-light, two-panel door, with insulated tempered glass, to match existing style and dimensions.
- Repair existing door jambs, as needed.
- Make any necessary repairs to the existing transom window, as needed.
- Final paint color to match existing.

Install New Screen/Storm Door

- Remove the existing, deteriorated, wooden screen door at the rear porch entrance.
- Applicant has the option to install a new, wooden screen door, to match the existing wooden screen door, <u>or</u>, install a new, aluminum storm door in the same location.
- <u>Cut sheet and color chip for the new storm door to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final</u> review and approval, prior to installation of the door.

18-4-3

636 South Fifth Street

Rob & Molly Tafrate (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-3, 636 South Fifth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Fence

- Remove the existing, wood privacy fence on the east, north, and south sides of the rear yard, in consultation with the neighboring property owner to the south.
- Install new, six-foot-high (6' H), wood privacy fence in same locations. Fence along south side of property to be on or within the property lines of 636 South Fifth Street, in consultation with the neighboring property owner to the south.
- Style of new fence to match the existing fence on the property to the south, per the submitted photographs.
- Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. <u>Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.</u>

18-4-4

46 East Frankfort Street

Muth & Co. Roofing (Applicant)

Scott & Anita Doran (Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-4, 46 East Frankfort Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof / House & Garage

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof of the house and the garage, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.

German Village Commission April 3, 2018 Agenda Page 10 of 19

- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:	Style:	<u>Color:</u>
[] GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	[] English Gray Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the roof of the inset front porch, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.

Repair Box Gutters

- Examine all box gutters on the house, and make any repairs and/or replace the existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

German Village Commission April 3, 2018 Agenda Page 11 of 19

• 18-4-5

636 South Grant Avenue

Daniel J. & Donna J. Hogan (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-5, 636 South Grant Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted: Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof of the two-story, brick house, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer: [] CertainTeed	Style: Carriage House (dimensional)	Color: [] Stonegate Gray
[] GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	[] English Gray Slate [] Weathered Slate
[] Certain Teed	(standard 3-tab)	[] Nickel Gray
[] GAF	Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)	[] Nickel Gray
[] Owens Corning	(standard 3-tab)	[] Estate Gray
[] Tamko	(standard 3-tab)	[] Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

• 18-4-6

632 South Fifth Street

Amy Weis (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-6, 632 South Fifth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted: Install New Fence

- Remove the existing, wood privacy fence on the east, north, and south sides of the rear yard, in consultation with the neighboring property owner to the south.
- Install new, six-foot-high (6' H), wood privacy fence in same locations. Fence along south side of property to be on or within the property lines of 636 South Fifth Street, in consultation with the neighboring property owner to the south.
- Style of new fence to match the existing fence on the property to the south, per the submitted photographs.
- Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. <u>Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic</u> Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

German Village Commission April 3, 2018 Agenda Page 12 of 19

18-4-7

792 Mohawk Street

Smaller World Construction (Applicant)

Seth Seymour & Keith DeLong (Owners)

Approve Application 18-4-7, 792 Mohawk Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted: Install Tie Rods & Plates

- Install new, through-wall, structural tension rods to stabilize the bowing, front/west wall of the masonry structure, per the submitted photographs.
- Tie rods and anchor plates to be located between the first and second stories, per the submitted photographs.
- Exterior anchor plates may be star-shaped, S-shaped, square, or circular. Square or circular plates to be painted to match the color of the existing brick, as closely as possible.
- Photographs of the completed work to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for the property file.

18-4-8

193 East Beck Street - Rear

Crystal Santin (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-8, 193 East Beck Street – Rear, as submitted, with all clarifications noted: Install New Windows

- Remove the six (6) existing, 12-lite, steel windows on the south and east elevations of the 1951 concrete, first-story of the modified barn building.
- Install new, 12-lite, Marvin, aluminum-clad wood windows in the same locations, per the submitted product cut sheet.
- Stainless munting to be permanently fixed on interior/exterior, with spacer between the two layers of glass.
- Exterior color to be "Ebony."
- New windows to fit the existing openings.

18-4-9

923 City Park Avenue

Everlasting Roofing (Applicant)

Matthew Cohen (Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-9, 923 City Park Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted: Install New Rubber Roof / Front Porch

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the flat, front porch roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.

Repair Box Gutters / Front Porch

- Examine all box gutters on the front porch roof, and make any repairs and/or replace the existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary

German Village Commission April 3, 2018 Agenda Page 13 of 19

repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

18-4-10

512 City Park Avenue

APCO Industries (Applicant)

Rachel Ferst (Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-10, 512 City Park Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted: Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof of the two-story, brick house, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be:

Manufacturer:	Style:	<u>Color:</u>
[] GAF	Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)	[] Nickel Gray

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

• 18-4-11

243 East Blenkner Street

Michael Evans (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-11, 243 East Blenkner Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted: <u>Install New Standing-Seam-Metal Roof/Rear Addition</u>

- Remove existing standing-seam-metal roofing on the low sloping roof of the rear addition, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new standing-seam-metal roofing, per the submitted specifications, all applicable City Code, and manufacturers' recommendations.
- New roofing to be 26 gauge, factory painted, 12" panels of steel, standing-seam roofing. Color to be "silver" to match existing.
- Applicant has the option to install new E. P. D. M. rubber, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.
- Existing slate on the main roof to remain, as is.

German Village Commission April 3, 2018 Agenda Page 14 of 19

• 18-4-12

622 Mohawk Street

Tim Meager (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-12, 622 Mohawk Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Exterior Painting / House & Garage

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood siding and trim elements, as needed. <u>All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood siding and trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.</u>
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house and garage for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to be: Body Benjamin Moore "Briarwood," to match existing; Trim to match existing color.

Install New Half-Round Gutters / Garage

- Install new, metal, half-round gutters and round, metal down spouts of the appropriate size on all elevations. Finish color to match trim color.
- Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile systems needed to insure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties.

• 18-4-13

539 South Fifth Street

Patrick Phillips (Applicant)

Marcia Burce/LAMS United Properties, LLC. (Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-13, 539 South Fifth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted: <u>Exterior Painting</u>

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. <u>All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.</u>
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the commercial building for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color to be "Black." Final paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for the property file.
- Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., stone columns, cornice, plinth, sills, lintels, etc.) is to remain unpainted.

• 18-4-14

32 East Beck Street

Kyle Haines (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-14, 32 East Beck Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Repair Box Gutters

- Examine all box gutters on the two-story, brick house, and make any repairs and/or replace the existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

German Village Commission April 3, 2018 Agenda Page 15 of 19

18-4-15

540 South Sixth Street

Karla Kayser (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-15, 540 South Sixth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted: Repair/Repaint Railings

- Remove the existing, metal hand rails at the front stoop for refinishing.
- Prepare all metal surfaces for repainting by removing any/all rust and loose paint with appropriate tools, as needed.
- Solid prime any/all bare metal with exterior metal primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Apply two (2) finish coats to the clean, dust-free metal components, in accordance with manufacturer's specifications. Finish color to be "Black," to match existing.

• 18-4-16

186 East Sycamore Street

William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)

Dan Kline (Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-16, 186 East Sycamore Street, for renewal of expired COA # 17-3-22 (Expired: March 7, 2017), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Exterior Alterations

- Install new, wood, Marvin, French doors on the front and side elevations of the existing front porch, per the submitted elevation drawings.
- Install new, wood, Marvin, French doors on the front elevation of side bump-out, per the submitted elevation drawings.
- Mullions between the sets of French Doors to measure approximately 5.5" wide.
- All French doors to be permanently fixed closed, or the grade of the porch is to be lowered, to avoid the requirement for railings.
- Restore corner columns, pilasters, beam, and sill on former front porch to recreate original "porch design."
- Columns and pilasters to include a 3/4" trim piece at top.
- Install new, Boral, flush, shiplap siding on the side bump-out.
- Convert the wedge-shaped roof of the side bump-out to a side-gable roof, per the submitted site plan.
- New roof to be standing-seam-metal or GAF Slateline.
- Existing slate on main roof to remain, as is.
- Revised drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- Cut sheets for doors and any exterior lighting to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Hartke/Durst (4-0-0) APPROVED

• 18-4-17

130-132 Jackson Street

David M. Wards/510 Lazelle, Ltd. (Applicant)

510 Lazelle, Ltd. (Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-17, 130-132 Jackson Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted: Install New Brick Sidewalk & Planting Beds

- Remove the existing, concrete, public sidewalk located between the foundation of the house and the street curb, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new paving bricks in the Basket Weave, Stretcher Bond, or Herringbone pattern, per the German Village Guidelines, pp. 124-125.
- New planting beds to be installed, per the submitted site plan.
- All work to be completed in consultation with the Department of Public Service, and per all applicable City Building Codes.

German Village Commission April 3, 2018 Agenda Page 16 of 19

- All work to be in accordance with industry standards, to insure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as necessary, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.

• 18-4-18

660 City Park Avenue

John L. Gibson (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-18, 660 City Park Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted: Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements on the brick house, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color to be "White" to match existing trim.
- Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., stone foundation, window sills and lintels, etc.) is to remain unpainted.

• 18-4-19

622 Mohawk Street

Everlasting Roofing (Applicant)

Tim Meager (Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-19, 622 Mohawk Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted: Install New Rubber Roof / Flat Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the rear, flat section, and low sloping section of the roof, down to the sheathing, per the submitted specifications. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Flash existing skylights, as needed.
- Install two (2) new vents for bathroom vents, and flash all new and existing vents on the flat roof.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.

German Village Commission April 3, 2018 Agenda Page 17 of 19

•	Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner			
	from the following approved shingles list:			
	Manufacturer:	Style:	Color:	
	[] CertainTeed	Carriage House (dimensional)	[] Stonegate Gray	
	[] GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	[] English Gray Slate [] Weathered Slate	
	[] Certain Teed	(standard 3-tab)	[] Nickel Gray	
	[] GAF	Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)	[] Nickel Gray	
	[] Owens Corning	(standard 3-tab)	[] Estate Gray	
	[] Tamko	(standard 3-tab)	[] Antique Slate	
•	All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."			
•	Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."			
•	Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVen			
	VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.			

• 18-4-20

637 Brust Street

Bryan & Lauren Gramlich (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-20, 637 Brust Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Tree Removal

- Remove the one (1) diseased, Blue Spruce tree located in the rear yard, per the submitted photos, site plan, and tree specialist's report.
- Tree removal to be done in accordance with standard industry practices to insure the safety of all neighboring properties.
- Remove the stump below grade to prevent new growth
- Haul away all debris.
- Planting of a new tree is not required, due to the limited space.
- Applicant has the option to plant a smaller tree or other landscaping.
- Applicant/Owner is to submit the choice of any new tree species to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval prior to the planting of the new tree.

German Village Commission April 3, 2018 Agenda Page 18 of 19

18-4-21

768 Jaeger Street

Justin Collamore (Applicant)

Jeff & Lucy Casewell (Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-21, 768 Jaeger Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Light Fixture

Install new exterior light fixture to the left of the front entrance door, per the submitted drawing and product cut sheet.

Install New Fence

- Install new, forty-eight inch high (48" H), Fortin #F49, black wrought iron fence and gate between 768 and 772 Jaeger Street, per the submitted site plan and product cut sheet.
- Fence to be located behind (east of) the first window on the south elevation.
- Fence to be free-standing, not attached to the buildings.

18-4-22

636 South Fifth Street

Rob & Molly Tafrate (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-22, 636 South Fifth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Landscaping

- Remove existing, overgrown plantings in rear yard, per the submitted photographs.
- Re-sod rear yard, per the submitted landscape plan.
- Install new plantings around perimeter of rear yard, per the submitted landscape plan.
- Install new, 4' x 6' x 18' raised planting bed, per the submitted landscape plan.

18-4-23

760 South Third Street

Will Lehnert/Outdoor Space Design (Applicant)

Ted & Catherine Ryan(Owner)

Approve Application 18-4-23, 760 South Third Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Relay Brick Public Sidewalk

- Remove existing brick, public sidewalk, between the existing wrought iron fence and street curb, and relay brick in the same location and pattern.
- Install new planting areas with raised brick edging, per the submitted section drawing.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as necessary, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.

Landscape/Hardscape - Front Yard

- Remove existing, stamped concrete in front yard.
- Reconfigure existing limestone edging, per the submitted plan.
- Install new, brick sitting area in the same location, per the submitted plan.
- Install new plantings, per the submitted landscape plan.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards, to insure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties.

Landscape/Hardscape - Rear Yard

- Remove existing, stamped concrete in rear yard, and install new, brick patio and pathways, per the submitted
- Install new, 18" High, limestone seat walls with limestone caps, per the submitted plan.
- Install new, self-contained fountain, per the submitted plan.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards, to insure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties.

Install New Privacy Fence

Remove the existing, wood privacy fence on the south property line.

German Village Commission April 3, 2018 Agenda Page 19 of 19

- Install new, 6'High, wood privacy fence on, or within the south property line, per the submitted plan.
- Fence design to match existing, per the submitted photographs.
- Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. <u>Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of stain/paint.</u>
- X. OLD BUSINESS
- **XI.** NEW BUSINESS
- **XII.** ADJOURNMENT